



# THE PROTECTORS OF IDENTITY

DYNAMICS OF NATIONAL AND GENDER IDENTITY AMONG PALESTINIAN  
WOMEN IN JORDAN

Marita M. Akersveen

17039621

Centre for Development and Emergency Practice, Oxford Brookes University

September 2018

This dissertation is submitted in partial fulfillment of the MA degree in  
Development and Emergency Practice, Oxford Brookes University

# Abstract

The Palestinian people were driven out of their land 70 years ago, and are currently dispersed all over the world. The diaspora are denied their Right Of Return to their homeland and are therefore forced to integrate into new societies. Three generations have been born since the first wave of refugees found shelter in other countries. Despite settling and raising families in other countries, the Palestinian diaspora still hold a strong collective identity. The purpose of this dissertation is to explore how the Palestinian identity has changed, by looking at the role and status of Palestinian women, in a cross-generational study in Jordan.

In order to do so, the dissertation looks at three research questions; how has the Palestinian identity changed across generations in Jordan? What role do the women of Palestine have in securing a Palestinian identity in the diaspora? What does the future look like for the Palestinian identity in the diaspora?

The case of Palestinians discredit any classical notions of what it means to have a national identity. In the literature review, the notion of identity is shown to be connected to both the personal and collective feelings of belonging, which disregards the suggestion that refugees lose their identity and power when torn from their home. By exploring gender roles in society and how they interact with national identity, theories of intersectionality and hybridity are discussed. The intersectionality refugee women experience is a factor in their sense of belonging and integration in a host country. It effects how the refugees form a new identity, that is not Palestinian nor Jordanian but a hybrid of the two, specific to their situation.

The primary research was conducted through interviews with 12 Palestinian women living in Jordan. These interviews covered topics such as their legal status, personal identification, their sense of belonging, education and work, and traditions. The analysis of the data reveals that the collective Palestinian identity has changed from the 1<sup>st</sup> generation; a memory and natural feeling of missing home, to the 3<sup>rd</sup> generation; a constructed feeling of belonging to a cause and land that was unjustly taken from their grandparents. Taking into consideration the gender perspective, it is evident that the role of the women in society has changed since the first wave of refugees. They hold greater responsibility and have become the protectors of ensuring that the Palestinian identity transfers to the new generations, meaning it is as strong today as it was 70 years ago, albeit in an augmented form.

*\*The cover photo is a picture take by me of a framed picture in Palestine, 2016*

This thesis is the result of my own independent work/investigation, except where otherwise stated. Other sources are acknowledged by explicit references.

Signed..... (candidate)      Date .....

I hereby give consent for my thesis, if accepted, to be available for photocopying and for inter-library loan, and for the title and summary to be made available to outside organisations.

Signed..... (candidate)      Date .....

## Statement of Ethics Review Approval

This dissertation involved human participants. A Form TDE E1 for each group of participants, showing ethics review approval, has been attached to this dissertation as an appendix.

# Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my dissertation supervisor Dr Cathrine Brun for her support and patience in this process. It is has been reassuring knowing we speak the same language (literally) despite it being more confusing than helping at times. I am forever grateful for the advice and words of encouragement she provided, both for the dissertation and sightseeing opportunities in Jordan during my fieldwork. I am convinced you are one of the hardest working women in this business, and it has been a privilege and an honour to have your guidance throughout this process.

I would also like to thank the extraordinary Palestinian women who invited me into their homes and shared their life experience with me. I am in awe of their strength, courage and humility. This dissertation would be nothing without the valuable knowledge and insight they so selflessly shared with me.

To my translator, Lina - an amazing woman. Your kindness and integrity helped make this dissertation what it is. Not only translating interviews but also opening your home to me and taking me around Amman allowed me to get to know Jordan on a larger scale. Thank you for your help and support, and I am sure we will see each other again soon.

To my parents, I am thankful for their invaluable support throughout this degree. By keeping their personal fears to themselves, they have allowed me to travel and explore my interests, for which I am forever grateful.

Lastly, I would like to thank Jack for his moral support throughout this process. In addition to reading over my drafts and checking my grammar, you have provided immense amounts of coffee and kept me sane.

# Contents

Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	iii
1.0 Introduction	1
2.0 Context	3
2.1 The background of Palestinian refugees	3
2.2 The Palestinian refugees in Jordan	3
2.3 Legal status	4
2.3.1 The different legal categories	5
<i>Table 1. Legal Categories (Abed, 2004).</i>	5
3.0 Literature review	7
3.1 Defining Identity	7
3.2 Victims of intersectionality	8
3.3 Gender roles	9
3.4 Palestinian identity	10
3.5 Hybridity	11
4.0 Research and Methodology	13
4.1 Approach	13
4.2 Selection of participants	13
4.3 Data collection	14
4.4 Analysis	15
4.5 Scope and limitations	15
4.6 Ethics	16
5.0 Findings and Analysis	17
5.1 Findings	17
<i>Table 2A - informant overview of Jabal el Hussein and Baqa'a camp</i>	17
<i>Table 2B - informant overview of Jerash camp and non-camp</i>	18
5.1.1 Legal status	18
5.1.2 Personal identification	19
5.1.3 Sense of belonging	20
5.1.4 Education and work	21
5.1.5 Traditions and rituals	21
5.2. Analysis	22
5.2.1 National identity	23
5.2.2 Gender	24
5.2.3 Intersectionality and Hybridity	25
6.0 Conclusion	28
Bibliography	30
Appendix 1 - Interview Guide	34
Appendix 2 - Info Sheet	36
Appendix 3- Ethics Form	38

# 1.0 Introduction

This year marked the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the first Arab-Israeli war, the catastrophe that forced the majority of Palestinians to flee their homeland. Since then, three generations of Palestinians have been born into refugee camps and into countries which are not their own. Demographics from 2010, show that the majority of Palestinian refugees are under 25 years old, and approximately 40% are below the age of 18 (Unicef.org, 2010), making the median age set at 16 whereas the majority have never seen or set foot in their own country.

Palestine has never been internationally recognised as a sovereign state. As of August this year, 137 out of 193 member states of the United Nations (UN) voted to recognise “the State of Palestine”, yet the Palestinian people are still officially stateless. In 2012, the UN passed a motion giving “The state of Palestine” the status of “non-member observer state”, and thus their struggle for autonomy continues. Despite being an old conflict, the physical resistance against Israel continues. The struggle can be seen in the news and on social media worldwide. Hundreds of Palestinian have been killed in Gaza over the last year, with even more injured. The events we are witnessing should be a reminder that the Palestinian people are still seeking independence and recognition within the international realm (BBC News, 2018).

As the conflict continues to unfold, the diaspora of Palestinians around the world show their support for those still living in their home country. Despite being exiled from their homeland for several generations, the Palestinian identity is still strong in the diaspora, which is what inspired this dissertation.

This dissertation seeks to examine the evolution of the Palestinian identity outside of Palestine. In doing so, a cross-generational structure to the study was necessary to be able to identify any patterns and/or changes. Whilst preparing for the research, the literature revealed a neglect in the representation of the female narrative. One of the few things to be found on Palestinian women were the UNRWAs homage to the women of Palestine in connection to the International Women’s day in 2014. The homage from UNRWA stood out as a different narrative than most of the other readings and gave the Palestinian women a face and a role many were surprised to see. Another important contribution to the Palestinian female narrative was a paper by Maria Holt on “Evolving Identities of Palestinian Refugee Women in Lebanon” written in 2007. Holt explores the women’s self-definition in the context of a national narrative of suffering and heroism, that has largely been shaped by masculine values. Similar to the aims of this dissertation, Holt explores the female narrative in the diaspora and seeks to bring forth their stories and evolving identities.

This research seeks to give women in the diaspora a platform to tell their story and get the recognition they deserve. They have often been neglected in the stories about Palestine and are often referred to as the mothers and wives of heroes (Genet, 1983). This label effectively ignores the role the women were given due to the conflicts and is not representative for the work they are still doing to raise generations that have awareness and know the meaning of their heritage. The research questions are formulated in order to respond to the overall aim of examining the changes of the Palestinian identity in the diaspora.

The research questions are the following:

- *How has the Palestinian identity changed across generations in Jordan?*
- *What role do the women of Palestine have in securing a Palestinian identity in the diaspora?*
- *What does the future look like for the Palestinian identity in the diaspora?*

To explore these questions, the dissertation will begin with an introduction to the context in Chapter 2, which will explain the history of why the Palestinians initially became refugees. It will also give an insight into what legal status they hold in Jordan, making it more context specific.

A literature review will follow in Chapter 3. This chapter will provide definitions and theories on concepts such as national identity, intersectionality, gender roles, the Palestinian identity and the theory of hybridity. It will represent a foundation of theory that will be reused in the findings and analysis in Chapter 5.

Chapter 4, research and methodology, will show the approach to the primary research. The methodology shows how and why the participants were chosen, the way the data was collected and analysed, in addition to going through the limitations and ethical considerations of the research.

Chapter 5, the findings and analysis chapter, is divided into two sections. The first section will present the findings of the primary research interviews according to themes. The data was coded according to five main themes: legal status, personal identification, sense of belonging, education and work, and traditions and rituals. In the second section, the findings from the primary research will be compared to the findings from the secondary research and discussed in accordance with the research questions.

The final Chapter will conclude the dissertation. It will state that the research has proven a generational change in the diaspora's notion of a collective Palestinian national identity. It will also look at how this change has happened and will accredit the women in the Jordanian diaspora as important protectors of the Palestinian identity. The chapter will end with a brief look at what the future might look like for the identity in the diaspora, which seems promising.

## 2.0 Context

This chapter describes and justifies the selection of the research setting; providing the history, background, and issues germane to the problem, by addressing how the Palestinians became refugees and what status they hold in Jordan.

### 2.1 The background of Palestinian refugees

The Middle East has, for decades, been at the centre of international discourse on economy, natural resources and strategic importance for peace at times of conflict. Throughout decades of conflict, peace-negotiations and ceasefires between countries in the region, one of the most persistent unresolved issues is the situation of the hundreds of thousands of Palestinian refugees.

Once a part of the Ottoman Empire, Palestine was put under a British Mandate following the partition of the Empire in the early 1920's. The mandate would last until Britain declared its end on the 14<sup>th</sup> of May 1948. In the lead up to the end of the mandate, the Second World War and the Holocaust had created an international growing sympathy for the thousands of displaced European Jews. This resulted in the international community, led by the UN General Assembly, pressuring Britain to resettle thousands of displaced Jews on Palestinian territory. A plan then developed to partition the Palestinian territory into two separate states, one Jewish and the other Arab, which was approved in November 1947 (Strawson, 2010).

The state of Israel was established in May 1948, immediately after the end of the British Mandate, beginning the tragic story of modern Palestinian life. The establishment of Israel was opposed not just by the Arabs of Palestine, but also by the neighbouring Arab states Jordan, Lebanon, Syria, Egypt and Iraq. As a statement against the formation of Israel and the support of Palestine these states sent in troops to defend the Palestinian territories. Despite their intentions, the attacks were uncoordinated and unsuccessful, resulting in what the Palestinians call the Al-Nakba, or "the Catastrophe" (Ben-Ze'ev, 2011). The Arab-Israeli war in 1948 was brutal and effectively made around half of Palestine's Arab population refugees. It is estimated, despite arguments against the figure's validity, that the birth of Israel resulted in 700,000 Palestinians fleeing their homeland. The Palestinians fled to the neighbouring countries that had given them support for refuge. Among them was Jordan, which ended up taking in around 1/10<sup>th</sup> of the refugees (Khalidi, 2010).

### 2.2 The Palestinian refugees in Jordan

Jordan has been deeply involved in the Palestinian cause for a long time, with the government approaching the Palestinian National movement for an independent state in different ways. Furthermore, Jordan has had a major impact on the lives of Palestinians living within its borders and has given them the opportunity to integrate and live within their society (Khalidi, 2010). In addition to taking in Palestinian refugees, Jordan annexed the West bank that was still under Palestinian control in 1949, officially uniting the East bank and the West Bank as "The Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan". In December 1949 a full Jordanian citizenship was given to any Palestinian living in Jordan who claimed it, and the Palestinians still living in the West Bank automatically became citizens of Jordan after its annexation. Subsequently, the elections the following year allowed everyone to vote, including Palestinian refugees

(Abu-Odeh, 1999) and resulted in a close to equal representation in Parliament between Palestinians and Jordanians. However, it is argued that Palestinians were never given any real political influence despite being the majority of the population (Khalid, 2010).

After 1948 Palestinian refugees made up the majority of the Jordanian population, with virtually all becoming full citizens of the country. Jordan, therefore, struggled to resettle and integrate this massive new population. The UN stepped in and formed the United Nations Relief and Works Agency (UNRWA) to look after and assist the Palestinian refugees, which it still does 70 years later (Unrwa.org, n.d.). The sheer size and prominence of the Palestinian population has aroused fear in some of the East Bank Jordanian nationalists in the past, creating a considerable amount of tension. Nevertheless, three generations of Palestinians have now been born and raised in Jordan as the descendants of Palestinian refugees. Some argue that Palestinians are so well assimilated in Jordan at this point that they consider themselves more Jordanian than Palestinian (Khalidi, 2010).

## 2.3 Legal status

As previously stated, following the Al-Nakba, all Palestinians who sought refuge in Jordan were given full citizenship if they wished to claim it. However, Palestinians in Jordan do not all hold a full citizenship. A second wave of Palestinian refugees arrived in Jordan after the second Arab-Israeli war in 1967, which forced many to flee from what was left of historical Palestine. These refugees received the status of 'displaced persons' for being relocated within the borders of Palestine, annexed by Jordan (A/RES/2252 (Es-v)). Those arriving from Gaza were not given any legal status, as they had been living under Egyptian military rule since 1949. The latter were eligible for temporary passports, but were denied citizenship and rights to vote as well as employment. The majority held Egyptian travel documents to ensure their travel to and from the Strip, but due to the Israeli attacks on the Sinai Peninsula, they were unable to travel and many stayed in UNRWA run refugee camps within Jordan (Justice.gov, 2009).

With the exception of the Gazans, every Palestinian in Jordan held a full citizenship until July 1988. At the height of the first Palestinian intifada, or uprising, against Israeli military occupation, the Jordanian King Hussein decided to end the annexation of the West Bank. His reasoning was to support the growing international recognition of the Palestinian Liberation Organisation as the representative for the Palestinian people and their wish for national autonomy. Palestinians residing in the West Bank, therefore, automatically lost their Jordanian nationality and were back to being stateless (Human Rights Watch, 2010). Since then thousands of Palestinian both in the West Bank and on the East Bank have had their citizenships revoked. In a report made by the Human Rights Watch in 2010, it is proved that the revocation of Jordanian citizenship seems to be a random and arbitrary process, making the future status of all Jordanians with Palestinian origins uncertain (Gabbay, 2014).

Legally the Palestinians are nowhere (King-Irani, 2007). The harsh reality that face the Palestinians who lost their citizenship is that they are once again left without a country to call home. "Jordan is playing politics with the basic rights of thousands of its citizens. Officials are denying entire families the ability to lead normal lives with a sense of security that most citizens of a country take for granted [...] Without nationality, individuals and families find it difficult to exercise their citizenship rights, including obtaining health care; finding work; owning property; travelling; and sending their children to public school and universities" (Gabbay, 2014: 1).

### 2.3.1 The different legal categories

The following table presents the different categories of legal statuses Palestinians in Jordan can hold (Abed, 2004). The table was produced by Refugee Studies Centre and is perceived by some as a very simple “picture” of a very complex situation. It should be noted that the table is, in this instance, used to provide a simple overview of the official statuses of the Palestinians, whilst the complexity of what the status means to each individual cannot be explained or justified by this table alone.

The table shows the different types of passports issued, with and without national numbers, as well as the different types of transit cards Palestinians may carry to enter and reside in Jordan. As shown by the table, the categories are linked to the different types of Palestinians usually associated with the documents such as; those displaced after the 1948 conflict; those displaced by the 1967 conflict; Palestinians from Jerusalem; Palestinians from the West Bank; and the Palestinians of Gaza. The table also attempts to give an insight into the different types of access and services each label provides. However, it should be noted again that this table is a simplified version of a very complex situation and does not present all the information connected to each legal category.

Origin	Residence	Kind of Passport	Family Book*	Card of Crossing**	Accessibility to services
<b>Jordanian – East Banker</b>	Permanent residency in Jordan	Five year passport with the National ID Number.	yes	-	Full access
<b>Jordanian – Palestinian of 1948</b>	Permanent residency in Jordan	Five-year passport with national ID Number.	yes	-	Full access
<b>Jordanian – Palestinian of 1967</b>	Permanent residency in Jordan	Five year passport with National ID Number.	yes	Yellow Card – family reunification	Full access
<b>Jordanian- Palestinian of 1967</b>	Permanent residency in the West Bank	Five-year passport without national ID number	No family book	Green Card	Work needs a work permit, university education payment in foreign fees, ownership with the approval of a ministerial council
<b>Jordanian- Palestinian from Jerusalem</b>	Permanent residency in Jerusalem	Five-year passport without national ID number	No	Green Card	Work needs a work permit, university education payment in foreign fees, ownership with the approval of a ministerial council.
<b>Palestinians of Gaza</b>	Permanent residency in Jordan	Two-year temporary passport	No	In case of family reunification – Blue Card	Work needs a work permit, university education payment in foreign fees, ownership with the approval of a ministerial council
<b>Palestinians of the West Bank or Gaza Strip</b>	Permanent residency in West Bank or Gaza Strip	Palestinian authority passport (LP)	No	Permission to enter	Treated like any Arab in Jordan: as long as there is a valid residency they can access services permitted for foreigners

Table 1. Legal Categories (Abed, 2004).

\* *Family book: this registers the civil status of the members of the family (birth and marital status)*

\*\* *Card of Crossing: a card given by the Follow-up and Inspection Department of the Jordanian Ministry of Interior. The Yellow Card indicates that the holder is a permanent resident in Jordan and she/he is able to go to the West Bank because of the family reunification card they hold. The Green Card indicates that the holder lives in the West Bank and their visit in Jordan is temporary (one should usually provide a reason, i.e. work permit, education certificate justifying their stay). The Blue Card is for Gazans, who live in Gaza or in Jordan with the indication that they were included in family reunification cards as being able to live in Gaza (Abed, 2004).*

The table shows a clear example of how family reunification plays a big part in defining a Jordanian's legal status. In Jordan, married women do not have a legal right to transfer their citizenship to their children without their husband's permission. What is more, women married to non-citizen men can only pass their citizenship to their children with the approval of the Council of Ministers. In theory, this is a legal possibility, yet in reality, applications where the father is of Palestinian origin are seldom approved, so much so that the majority of the population rarely apply (Justice.gov, 2009). This means that citizenship traditionally follows the father's legal status and so poses challenges to those who wish to reside in Jordan, but do not have a father with Jordanian citizenship, effectively leaving them 'stateless'.

Statelessness is something all Palestinians are faced with in regards to their home country. Nonetheless, statelessness does not seem to have had any effect on their feeling of a collective national identity. Their feeling of a national identity is questioned by many, as the population of Palestine legally do not have a "nation", this notion will be explored further in the following chapter.

## 3.0 Literature review

This chapter will outline the most important theories and concepts relevant to the study. In order to operationalise the study, it will look at identity from the angle of nation and gender. It will explore how they intersect, to give a better understanding of how it affects Palestinian women. Furthermore, it will look at the Palestinian identity's development. At the end, the chapter will examine how the notion of a hybrid identity is formed in diasporas to make it more contextual to the following primary research. All of the data and information is collected from articles, books, websites and reports.

### 3.1 Defining Identity

In order to look deeper into this issue of how the identities of refugees change, it is necessary to define and operationalise the concept. Whether it is mundane or extraordinary, identity plays a key role in everyday life. The most basic description of identity is the human capacity to know who is who and what is what. It is a tool to map the human world and our places in it, both as individuals and as members of collectives (Ashmore et al., 2004). Rather than being a 'thing' everyone has, identity is a process that everyone goes through. It is always changing and different for each individual (Jenkins, 2008). Often identity is perceived to be rooted in language and affected by its surroundings, both on a local and global scale. Gender, class, relationships, work, religion and many other factors contribute to define a person's identity and how they are perceived by others. Greenfeld and Chirof (1994) suggest that national identity is the strongest, most fundamental in the modern world. Despite identity being shaped by a number of factors, they argue that national identity is the very essence of an individual and other factors simply modify this. It can be argued that Greenfeld and Chirof's statement on identity and the nation-state is outdated. However, in this era of rapid globalization, with a higher number of nation states than ever before, the concept of national identity is still as strong and relevant as it was when the statement was first made a quarter of a century ago. The world community today is a modern construct of nations, and societies that are not 'nations' are not yet considered to be modern. However, the argument that the modern creation and separation of nation-states define the essence of our identities has been rejected by many within the field of refugee and displaced people's studies.

As the focal point of this study, the Palestinians are a people without a recognised nation-state, and thus their identity cannot be explained in regards to Greenfeld and Chirof's argument. In contemporary society, there is a need to understand that national identity is not constrained to the Westphalian idea of a set specific sovereign territory. National identity comes from many different sources in addition to geography: values, language, race, ethnicity, symbols, habits and behaviours (Anderson, 1983; Orgad, 2015). Given that national identity comes from all of these different components, it is inherently a subjective concept that is interpreted in different ways by different people (Billig, 1995). As the majority of Palestinians are spread out across the world in a diaspora, most of them hold a passport or citizenship in the country in which they reside, providing them with what some may define as a 'national identity'. However, their 'new' citizenship does not automatically provide them with the national identity of the state they have been given refuge in. There is a general consensus among Palestinians that their national identity originates from their homeland, the occupied territories of Palestine, despite its lack of international recognition as a sovereign state.

In refugee studies, it is important to look at the different approaches to the relationship between place and identity. The Palestinian case is a perfect example of why the relationship between place and identity is complex and cannot be understood by only considering internationally recognised nationalities. The argument presented by Greenfeld and Chirot (1994) takes the approach of space being conceptualized as a singular, fixed and unchanging location, something that is an immobilizing surface (Massey, 1994). It suggests that all people have a natural place in the world, and being torn loose from that place will consequently tear them loose from their culture and identity (Brun, 2001).

However, refugee studies show that massive movements of populations and refugees discredit that approach to the relationship between place and identity. Another approach that ought to be examined, particularly when focusing on the Palestinian context, is one which separates the two. Effectively de-territorializing the power of national identities will provide a much deeper understanding of the changing identities of refugee populations. By doing so we can better examine the possibilities and constraints that come from being in a set place, and understand that refugees still have power and a strong identity despite being torn away from their 'home'. In addition, this can expose the challenges stemming from the attitudes of the host communities towards refugees (Brun, 2001). These global flows and movements of people lead to new degrees of connectedness and open up new possibilities for contact, communication and social identification (Preece, 2016). It needs to be stated that despite the disregard for nationality as the sole essence of a person's identity, it does affect their lives in many aspects. Being torn from your home and forced to flee to another place challenges a person's economic, legal, cultural and social situation, and thus touches upon the very essence of existence. There is no denying that roots play a big part in identity, and it is often believed that people do not know who they are unless they can know or trace their roots (Tuan, 1980).

### 3.2 Victims of intersectionality

In addition to being ripped from the very essence of their existence, many refugees experience being dehumanized by parts of their host countries. As a refugee, you are unquestionably vulnerable and often positioned at the 'bottom' of society. With little or no possessions and no 'home' to go to, you are completely dependent on the kindness, support and help of others for shelter and safety (Esses et al., 2008). The dependency refugees experience is often the foundation, leading to their struggle within intersectionality. Intersectionality is a framework created by Kimberlé Crenshaw when discussing the issues of black women's employment in the US (1989). Intersectionality seeks to show how different social divisions overlapping can be marginalising, often, but not exclusively, with a focus on gender, race and class. It explains how multiple forms of discrimination in a type of interlocking system of power impact those who are most marginalised in society on the basis of their identity. In practical terms, history tells us that women are more marginalised than men and coloured people are more marginalised than white people. Thus coloured women are at the highest risk of being marginalised, not just because of their gender, but also because of their skin colour. Before this theory arose, the different social divisions were analysed separately. However, within sociological, feminist, and other legal, political and policy discourses of international human rights, there has been a growing recognition of the inadequacy of analysing the divisions completely separately from each other (Yuval-Davis, 2006).

The separation of race and gender in particular as internally homogenous social categories has shown inadequacy in understanding the struggle of marginalised groups in society (Yuval-Davis, 2006). In the original theory presented by Crenshaw, women of colour regarded issues of black women in the US, however, it can also be interpreted

as the marginalisation of women of another race i.e. refugee women coming into another country. Lastly, having an identity that is defined by being legally 'stateless' in the eyes of the world, and in addition to this being a woman seeking refuge, the Palestinian women are, according to the intersectionality theory, at major risk of being marginalised on the basis of their gender and race. However, not all Palestinian women would agree with the classification. As will be explored later, some women would argue that they are more respected and privileged on the basis of their gender, rather than marginalised for it. It is important to emphasise that naturalised narratives and categories can be different for different cultural traditions, and some may be emphasised more than others, depending on the culture (Cohen, 1988). In some cultures "the woman is really the stronger sex" (Yuval-Davis, 2006: 199).

### 3.3 Gender roles

Another defining part of an individual's identity is gender and what norms and expectations follow. The research is focused on the narrative of the Palestinian women, therefore it is necessary to examine what social biases come with being a woman in such a context.

An important distinction to make is the difference between sex and gender, which is often misunderstood. While sex is the biological differences between males and females, gender is socially produced differences between being feminine and masculine. Gender is the majority of the time connected to the different sexes but is based on the socially created pre-assumptions that women are supposed to be feminine and men are supposed to be masculine. These are also the main features of 'patriarchy', a social system where men have become dominant in relation to women (Holmes, 2007). Patriarchy, however, is not a new idea. A woman's role as socially subordinate to a man has been considered a 'natural given' for as far back as history goes. This was also recognised by great thinkers like Karl Marx, Émile Durkheim and Max Weber, who saw women's dependent social position as determined by "the normal superiority of the physical and intellectual energies of the male" (Sydie, 1987: 59). Given that these thinkers and sociologist tried to convey how social forces affected everything, it seems odd that they would see 'sex roles' (gender was not a concept back then) to be naturally determined (Holmes, 2007).

On the contrary to Weber's idea, Talcott Parsons, an advocate for the twentieth century's functionalism, argues that the gender roles are complementary and come from the workings of social groups (1956). Parsons claims that the emotional expressive role of raising children and taking care of the house is assigned to women, whilst the instrumental and goal focused role of paid work away from the home is associated with men. As children have become socialised into these roles, they have become the norm and are thus not naturally determined (Parsons and Bales, 1956). However, since the 1950's, when Parsons published this theory, sociology has switched focus towards the limitations labels such as housewife and breadwinner put on women. It has also emphasised that having a housewife is a luxury for families who earn enough money, with many being reliant on both parents working to get by (Holmes, 2007).

The idea of women being housewives is still an idea that is deeply rooted in many cultures around the world. The way gender roles shape an identity is also strongly connected with what social group they belong to. In her book on gender socialisation (1976), Sue Sharpe claims that children have a limited agency in the formation of their gender identities, mirroring Parsons' arguments. In doing so, she examines how a particular gendered history,

economic conditions, ideologies conveyed by the media, the education system and how work is organised, affects the process of girls becoming women. In her discoveries, she finds that women belonging to the working class are often less interested in school and more in a rush to get married. The underlying suggestion, in this case, seems to be that the women have been 'brainwashed' by society. Dominant structures in society will gender their lives, and thus gender conventions will be followed in a fairly predictable way, perpetuating class and gender inequalities (Sharpe, 1976). As a consequence, it is therefore harder for working class girls to be successful because they do not have the same sociological advantages as, for example, middle class girls or boys (Holmes, 2007).

One could discredit that assumption by arguing that society has become more open and modern, particularly for women and their role in families as well as the communities surrounding them. As a result of this, new trends encouraging and supporting women and their independence have spread to different parts of the globe, including the Arab world. The Arab world is often associated with old traditional values and family life is frequently influenced by religious views (Obeidat et al., 2012). Nevertheless, the fact of the matter is many women from the Arab world are going to university, getting involved in the community and working to provide for their families. There is now a growing demographic of women who are not sticking to the typical, traditional family structure of being 'just' a housewife.

The role of the Palestinian women in Jordan has undeniably changed since before they became refugees. Prior to the conflict, the women were housewives catering to their families, whilst simultaneously being highly active in their communities and the fields of the villages alongside their parents and spouses (Khatib et al., 2005). However, during times of conflict, their primary role was to protect their children and home, whilst the men were out fighting the opposition. Following that, as refugees, women had the responsibility of physically rebuilding homes and communities in addition to cooking, cleaning and raising their children as many men had been killed or imprisoned by Israeli forces (Holt, 2007).

### 3.4 Palestinian identity

As previously discussed in section 3.1, the Palestinian identity discredits the idea that a national identity is an essential, transcendent given. (Khalidi, 2010). The fact that there is a strong Palestinian nationalism cannot be denied or dismissed in any way. It can be seen in their global diaspora. The lack of international recognition of a sovereign Palestinian state does not mean their national identity as a Palestinian people is any less relevant. Nationalism, in any case, is a construct: "nationalism, which sometimes takes pre-existing cultures and turns them into nations, sometimes invents them, and often obliterates pre-existing cultures: *that is a reality*" (Gellner, 2006: 49). The construct and evolution of Palestinian national identity has been the focus of much research and academic discussions. In some ways the Palestinian identity, as any national identity, has always existed in relation and opposition to another different, competing alter ego (Said, 1992). In relevance to the argument made by Said, some scholars claim that the Palestinian identity was non-existent and constructed as a response to Israel in 1948. However, considering Palestine was a part of the Ottoman Empire before the birth of Israel, and thus had a construct of a national identity in opposition to the other Arab nations, that argument is invalid.

Regardless of the differences in opinion on Palestinian nationalism, there is a consensus that the Al-Nakba changed everything for the Palestinian identity (see Chapter 2). 78% of Palestinians were dispersed from their homes and

became refugees, which has undoubtedly had an effect on their collective identity (Sa'di, 2002). Rabinowitz (1994), and Sanbar (2001), are among the academics that define the Palestinian identity solely out of their loss and deprivation as a result of the events of 1948. They argue that their identity is mainly formed as a result of dispossession, exile and the lack of international recognition for the Palestinians' rights and suffering. Though there is disagreement on the original theory on their identity, it is essential to understand the impact 1948 had on Palestinians. "The contemporary history of the Palestinians turns on a key date: 1948. That year, a country and its people disappeared from maps and dictionaries.. 'The Palestinian people does not exist', said the new masters, and henceforth the Palestinians would be referred to by general, conveniently vague terms, as either 'refugees', or in the case of a small minority that had managed to escape the generalized expulsion, 'Israeli Arabs'. A long absence was beginning" (Sanbar, 2001: 87).

Three generations have gone by since the majority of Palestinians had to flee their homes, yet we can still see and feel a strong Palestinian identity in their diaspora around the world. This is despite the fact that many Palestinians in refugee camps around the Middle East today have no or little memory, or direct experience of their homeland. They have memories of parents and grandparents telling stories about the homeland that is rightfully theirs but has been taken away from them indefinitely (Holt, 2007). Based on this, Raissiguier suggests that their identity has become "the product of an individual or a group of individuals' interpretation and reconstruction of their personal history and particular social location, as mediated through the cultural and discursive context to which they have access" (1999: 140). Khalidi explains well how the most basic issues posed by Palestinian identity brings a people together and can be found at a border, an airport or a checkpoint. "...at these borders and barriers that the six million Palestinians are singled out for "special treatment," and are forcefully reminded of their identity: of who they are, and of why they are different from others" (Khalidi, 2010: 1).

### 3.5 Hybridity

When Arabs move across borders within the 'Arab world' they are generally not perceived to be getting a new 'status' or identity. Within the Middle East, many of the Arab states have a similar type of culture and if you move within those states you are still a part of the Arab community. Make no mistake, each Arab country is different from the other and cultural differences are found within each country. However, certain beliefs and attitudes are shared by many Arabs across national borders and social classes, making it relatively 'easy' for Arabs to move across borders (Obeidat et al., 2012). The Palestinians are, therefore, quite 'special' to have been given refuge and citizenship in many of the neighbouring countries, where they have now raised families for generations.

The change of identity refugees go through is often examined in relation to their experience of a new culture and its impact on them. Adjacent to this, it is often suggested that refugees or immigrants feel torn between their own and the host country's culture. They will have to choose between the two; you integrate into your host country 'belong with us', or you remain a 'foreigner' by feeling a belonging to your own culture. A theory of a hybrid identity, presented by Floya Anthias (2001), contests this argument by suggesting that refugees form a completely new identity as a hybrid between the two. She states that the notion of hybridity as a theory is a more adequate way of addressing the range of issues relating to identity and the feeling of belonging rather than looking at identity in the parameters of old ethnicities. In practical terms this argues that Palestinians who now reside in Jordan, do not have to feel torn between the two cultures or identities. On the contrary, this suggests that the diaspora of Palestinians

have developed a completely new hybrid identity where they feel a mixed sense of belonging to both cultures and ethnicities, effectively creating a whole new group identity to relate and belong to. The creation of this new hybrid identity is something that needs to be included in the eternal discussion on the Palestinians 'Right of Return'.

It seems impossible to examine the Palestinian identity without including the hope for their right of return. The Right of Return is a universally recognised right within international refugee law, human rights law, and the law of nationality, among others. It is intended to be a protective right for refugees in the aftermath of conflict. However, this does not seem to be the case for the Palestinians. For the Palestinians the Right of Return achieved customary status in 1948, asserting their right to return to their homes and to obtain restitution and compensation, in resolution 194 by the UN General Assembly (A/RES/194). The implementation of resolution 194 was made conditional for Israel's admission as a member of the UN, but has been disregarded by Israel on the basis that its compliance would undermine their Jewish character. Due to Israel's violation of international law on this matter, the Palestinians are denied their Right of Return to their homeland (Sayej, 2018). As such, generations of Palestinians are now raised in other countries. Though the Right of Return is still the hot topic for the majority, it seems fewer and fewer actually believe it will one day become reality. The idea of returning to Palestine is a growing paradox for many Palestinians, who now have settled and raised families in other countries. It seems they speak of their burning wish for the Right of Return, yet being hesitant to leave their new 'hybrid' life in the same sentence, as if it is considered taboo not to want to return if given the chance.

To explore the aims presented in chapter 1, it is necessary to look at how the theories above intersect with each other. Both nationality and gender are defining notions of an individual's identity. The nationality often decides the culture of how your gender role is perceived in society, and thus assumes a person's experience with intersectionality. Refugees often suffer from intersectionality due to being displaced in host countries with different cultures. The result of this can often put pressure on refugees to adapt to another culture and identity. As will be explored further in Chapter 4, this can inspire a hybrid identity specific to refugees who feel torn between their home country and their host country.

## 4.0 Research and Methodology

The initial research strategy and subsequent design is a result of a reflexive process between a desk-based research of secondary sources of literature and a selection of primary research interviews during fieldwork. In this chapter, I will present and explain the process of how the research was conducted; through selection of participants, data collection and data analysis. Lastly, I will look at the scope and limitations of the research and explain the ethical considerations taken.

### 4.1 Approach

The first approach to the topic was to conduct a literature review in order to grasp the complexity of the situation I was studying. From previous experience doing research in Palestine, and the social nature of the research, it was necessary to have mixed research methods with both desk-based secondary sources and primary research interviews to get a deeper understanding of the situation. The formulation of the research questions were inspired by the initial readings, where I discovered that female narratives were largely missing. Due to this, the research questions have become an attempt to help fill a gap, and provide a platform for the women of Palestine.

The research started with desk-based secondary sources to lay a foundation of theoretical understanding. Reports, books, journals and online articles provided a basis for theory, which would eventually form an interview guide for the primary research that can be found in the appendix number 1.

Due to the experience-oriented nature of the aims, it was concluded that the best solution to the primary research was to do qualitative interviews. Qualitative interviews takes people's judgements, emotions, ideas, and beliefs into consideration, which can only be described in words and not mathematically measured. Qualitative research allows for the investigation of human beings, the societies they live in, and cultures they are a part of (Walliman, 2011), hence it will provide a rich insight into the experiences of Palestinian women in Jordan.

### 4.2 Selection of participants

Through contact with a friend, I was able to travel to Amman, Jordan and do interviews with Palestinian women. An aim was set to interview 10 - 15 women. Taking into consideration the focus of comparing generations, allowing up to five different families to be interviewed, assuming they had three generations of women. The informants had to be over 18 for two main reasons; to avoid ethical issues with interviewing children and to ensure that they were old enough to understand and be able to answer the questions. The informants had to be women with Palestinian heritage, living in Jordan, and within the first three generations from, and including the first Palestinian refugees. The categories of generations were divided accordingly; 1<sup>st</sup> generation were those who arrived in Jordan as a Palestinian refugee, 2<sup>nd</sup> generation, the children of the first generation of refugees born in Jordan, and lastly 3<sup>rd</sup> generation, the grandchildren of the first Palestinian refugees. For this reason, the representatives for each generation do not necessarily belong to the same age group, and may be at different stages of their lives.

The sampling of the informants was based on a non-probability method. Non-probability sampling is often used in cases, much like this one, where criteria is quite specific or participants are hard to find (Walliman, 2011). For that reason, a random sampling of the population would not guarantee representatives from all generations, coupled with the small size of the sample, the data collected from a random sampling may not be relevant to the aims.

Due to the language barrier, a translator was hired. The translator, a Palestinian woman who worked as a freelance journalist, had experience in translating and interviewing many Palestinian refugees in her previous work. After providing her with the background for my research, she reached out to personal contacts and was able to set up several interviews with Palestinian women. The women were based in three different refugee camps: Baqa'a, Jabal el-Hussein and Jerash, in addition to a few living outside of the camps. By looking at table 2, which can be found in section 5.2, the age of the informants ranged from 23 - 65 years. In addition the three generations were intentionally, equally represented with four informants per generation. Keeping in mind the scope and aims of the research, the number was considered realistic for a master's dissertation.

### 4.3 Data collection

The way of accessing the refugee camps and making contact with the informants was initially a non-probability, quota sampling method. The first interviewees were not randomly chosen as the translator, for the purpose of the interviews, had contacted them prior to the interview taking place. The interviews took place in their homes, making it possible to interview different generations within the same family. However, not all camps had three generations of women within the same family, and thus a snowballing method was used to find more women to interview to fill the generation quota. The neighbours of the initial informants were contacted and were asked to participate to fill the necessary quota, making the data collection semi-random (Walliman, 2011).

For the research to be feasible, it needed to operationalise the concept of identity, which is an abstract concept, and hard to measure. A decision was made to operationalise identity in relation to nationality, legal status and a sense of belonging; this was explored in further detail in Chapter 2. The interviews were recorded and some notes were taken by hand. During the interview other forms of electronic help was avoided to make the conversation more intimate and personal.

Face-to-face interviews with the participants were conducted in their own home, in a private room to ensure they felt safe to speak freely. The structured questions for the informants can be found in appendix number 1. The informants all seemed very eager to tell their story, confirming my initial thought that their narrative felt neglected. The interviews were qualitative and semi structured with open ended questions (Walliman, 2011). The interview guide provides insights into the structured questions. In addition, the answers the informants provided were followed up by other questions relevant for their story, creating a co-production of knowledge and a conversation between the participant and the interviewer. The informants all seemed strongly opinionated on the subject, making it easy for the interview to flow naturally, and explore all the themes

## 4.4 Analysis

The nature of qualitative data can make it difficult to analyse. The data collected is a result of individual human feelings, attitudes and judgements and how they interplay in society, and so great care should be taken in the analysis. The data was analysed firstly through a pattern system of coding. The pattern system allowed the data to become divided into more compact and meaningful groupings (Walliman, 2011). All participants were asked the same questions, and the answers they provided were coded manually and individually according to themes such as; legal status, personal identification, education level/ work, and traditions and rituals. Once done, the interviews were compared to the others belonging to the same generation to find common themes and patterns. Finally, the different generations were compared against each other, to uncover any patterns or possible changes.

When analysing the data, it is important to be critical of any answers that may seem 'extreme' to the other answers provided on the same subject. As such each interview was a story-telling session, a mini-case study on their family history if you may, and any 'extreme' cases may be just as relevant to the research as the others. In the case of anomalies, great care was taken to find out why the answers differed so much from the rest. In all cases those answers were justified, contributing to more pertinent research.

## 4.5 Scope and limitations

Due to the language barrier, the need for a translator was necessary. The translator, though professional, had strong opinions on the topic, creating a biased element in all interviews. In a dominant discourse such as this, a bias could challenge or make it difficult to present any alternative opinions. From my own observations, some of the subjects discussed were perceived as taboo, and so having a third party that was not completely impartial might have affected some of the answers. In my perception all the informants seemed quite comfortable having a Palestinian woman to talk to, and thus my relationship with her made me more trustworthy. Nonetheless, some informants seemed to give answers they thought they ought to, rather than being completely honest. Great care has therefore been taken in analysing the material, to avoid making any assumptions from answers that were perceived as 'adjusted'. The majority of the quotes and examples that will be presented are therefore taken from the women that were perceived to have very strong opinions and confidence to speak their minds.

The level of education had an impact on the research. There was one unexpected illiterate informant who had to orally consent before the translator signed her name on the ethics form. In addition, some of the questions on identity seemed too abstract for many. Questions often had to be rephrased to make it more applicable to real life, rather than how the informants 'felt' about the subject, possibly affecting their answers. Some of the questions also inspired the informants to talk about their childhood, which, for some, was a long time ago. Memories might have changed over time, and memories during times of conflict may have been suppressed. Some of the perceptions they have now as adults may have changed their original experience of childhood and conflict memories, possibly affecting their answers (Hu et al., 2017).

## 4.6 Ethics

Ethical considerations are always raised when working with human participants. The main rule of research ethics is; do no harm. The ethical issue in this case is; “The researchers treatment of other people involved in the research, relating to informed consent, confidentiality, anonymity and courtesy” (Walliman, 2011: 43). A further key element in ethical considerations is the importance of anonymity and consent. Giving participants anonymity assures a reduced risk of any harmful consequences happening. Having their consent to use, and on how to use their information shows good ethics and honesty, giving the research more legitimacy.

Before the interview, the informants were given an information sheet, which was read out to them in their native tongue explaining why the research was being done, how it would be used, and all possible negative or positive consequences that could come of it. The information was given to each informant to keep, also after the interview, in case of any questions they may have. The information sheet can be found in appendix number 2, along with an ethics form approved by the University in appendix number 3.

For the purpose of confidentiality, no names of any informants will be revealed, rather they will be defined according to their generation and location at the time the interview took place. The location and generation is relevant to provide a perspective of the informants 'position' in society. A list of informants and their transcriptions are internal documents and will be referred to as *Interview Transcripts 1- 12* in the bibliography.

## 5.0 Findings and Analysis

The findings in the first part of this chapter are based on the information gathered from the primary research interviews, whilst also drawing upon the theories from Chapter 3. The second half of this chapter will use the analysed data to discuss the aims of the research.

### 5.1 Findings

To explain the information gathered in the interviews, a table has been set up in an attempt to make it easier to visualise. The table is a simplified way of showing the different answers provided by the informants, separated by themes, generations and location. The following table is separated into two parts; Table 2A is the informants from Jabal el Hussein and Baqa'a, whilst Table 2B is the informants from Jerash and non-camp.

Table 2A - informant overview of Jabal el Hussein and Baqa'a camp.

	Jabal el Hussein			Baqa'a		
Generation	1st	2nd	3rd	1st	2nd	3rd
Age	59	48	23	65	32	32
Legal status	Citizenship - "useless"	Citizenship + UNRWA	Citizenship - "useless"	Citizenship	Citizenship	Citizenship + Green Card
Personal ID	Palestinian	Jordanian - Palestinian	Jordanian (said Palestinian first)	Jordanian	Palestinian	Jordanian
Feeling of belonging:						
Jordan	Likes it, not home	Belongs here	Belongs here	Home, belongs here	Our home, comfortable	Homecountry
Palestine	Home, would return	Homecountry	Homecountry	Would not return	Homecountry	Heritage
Work	Housewife	Housewife	Yes	Housewife	Housewife	Housewife, looking for job
Education level	12th grade + diploma	9th grade	12th grade	No, illiterate	10th grade	BA in Biology
Traditions/ rituals	Storytelling/ cuisine	Storytelling/ cuisine/ clothing	Storytelling/ cuisine/ clothing	Storytelling/ cuisine/ dress	Storytelling	Storytelling/ cuisine/ clothing
Has it changed?	Yes, in a negative way, women are "just" housewives now.	Very much, women enjoying their rights	Positive change, more open minded, more education	No, same	New generation know "nothing" of Palestine	Yes, women are stronger
Future?	Positive, awareness	Stronger, awareness	Strong Palestinian identity	Unsure	Unsure, think it will be forgotten	Dependent on the mothers

Table 2B - informant overview of Jerash camp and non-camp.

	Jerash			Non-Camp		
<b>Generation</b>	1st	2nd	3rd	1st	2nd	3rd
<b>Age</b>	65	28	45	56	31	47
<b>Legal status</b>	2 year passport, w/o national no.	Only birth certificate, no rights	2 year passport, w/o national no.	Citizenship	Citizenship + Green Card	Citizenship
<b>Personal ID</b>	Palestinian	Neither, in limbo	Jordanian-Palestinian	Jordanian Palestinian	Jordanian Palestinian	Jordanian (father is from Palestine)
<b>Feeling of belonging:</b>						
<b>Jordan</b>	No, just happy to be alive	Belong to Jerash, not in the camp	Home, belongs here	Home, belongs here Arab	Home, belong here	Homecountry
<b>Palestine</b>	Homecountry	Not proud of her heritage	Heritage, would return	Original home	Homecountry, would not return	Belonging
<b>Work</b>	Farmer and housewife	Unofficial work (no papers), housewife	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Education level</b>	6th grade in Gaza	Unofficial university degree	12th grade + diploma	BA in business and economics	MA in development and environment	PHD in Development Planning
<b>Traditions/rituals</b>	Woolworks, the arabic carpets, sewing and broidery	Not open to learn anything traditional from Palestine	Storytelling/clothing/ cuisine	Storytelling/cuisine/c lothing/dancing	Storytelling/cuisine/c lothing/wedding traditions	Storytelling/clothing/ raditons
<b>Has it changed?</b>	Yes, younger generations don't know anything	Yes, open minded, women are much more active	Yes, women do less, but have more responsibility	Yes, more involved, more opportunity	Yes, women have taken on more roles and responsibilities	Yes, more invovled, less divide
<b>Future?</b>	Hope it grows stronger	Slowly fade, young people are held back by heritage	Going to be weaker, nothing to be proud of	Hopefull it will be strong, dependent on mothers	*Interview ended early*	Hopeful, very good at transferring identity

### 5.1.1 Legal status

As shown by Table 1, the legal status of Palestinians in Jordan differ a lot, depending on who you are and where your family is from. In this case, there is no need to compare legal status across generations; due to the fact that legal status traditionally follows the father. As confirmed by the informants this usually means that the same legal status can be found throughout the family. However, to examine the legal status of the informants it is useful to separate them by location. By grouping the informants into locations, it is made evident that the 'value' and perception of holding a Jordanian passport and citizenship differs quite a lot. The majority of the informants have full citizenship and although that seems positive, there is a clear disagreement of what holding a passport ensures.

The more established Palestinians, those living outside camps, made it very clear that they experienced equal rights and opportunities as East Bank Jordanians (with non-Palestinian backgrounds). The only exception was in the public sector, where the East Bankers were generally prioritised. This is also made evident by the fact that they all studied abroad and are currently working, thus their passports have allowed them to travel and have provided them with employment. In contrast to this, the informants from the Jabal el Hussein camp expressed a dismay with their citizenship and passport, claiming it was "just a number, completely useless" (1<sup>st</sup> generation, Jabal el Hussein). It can seem as though despite having a citizenship, several of the informants hardly feel it has any value to them, posing the question of what the true value of holding a Jordanian passport is.

To give an idea of the Jordanian passports international value, according to the Global Passport Index, its power is ranked 69<sup>th</sup> out of a possible 86 (Passport Index - All the world's passports in one place., 2018). This means that internationally the passport does not hold a great value, however it does have value to majority of the people living in Jordan.

It seems the Palestinians living outside camps consider their citizenship and the rights that come with it a functioning certainty. The informants in camps however, did not experience a certainty in having their rights upheld by their citizenship, and thus seemed to make less use of it. Despite the perceived lack of function for some of the informants, the women from the Jerash camp, also known as the "Gaza camp" seem desperate for any type of legal status or citizenship, as they have none. Two of the informants have a two year passport without a national number. In reality this is only a symbol of a legal permanent residency in Jordan, furthermore, it does not give them the right to vote, work or education, effectively putting them in the same category as foreigners. Unsurprisingly, due to their lack of rights, the Jerash informants seemed less eager than the rest to speak positively of Jordan.

### 5.1.2 Personal identification

To be able to understand changes in identity in this diaspora, it would be necessary to explore how the different informants identified as individuals. When faced with the question: "How do you identify, or where are you from?" many of the informants had a moment to think before answering. Their first responses differed between three categories, Palestinian, Jordanian and Jordanian-Palestinian, with close to the same amount of representatives on all answers.

A discovery during the research revealed that identifying as Jordanian could be perceived by some as unthinkable and offensive to their Palestinian heritage. Interestingly, the informants who answered "Jordanian" were almost exclusively from the 3<sup>rd</sup> generation. Their main argument was: "I was born and raised here, I know nothing of Palestine, only through what my grandparents told me. I have been here my whole life" (3<sup>rd</sup> generation, Baqa'a). The natural explanation is that the 3<sup>rd</sup> generation of Palestinians have been born and raised in Jordan, from parents with the same history. Their idea of Palestine is the home country their grandparents spoke of, that they are denied from entering, and thus struggle to connect to. When asked about their identity one of the informants from the 3<sup>rd</sup> generation replied "Jordanian" instantly before stopping, thinking and telling the translator to change her answer: "no - tell her I said Palestinian" (3<sup>rd</sup> generation, Jabal el Hussein). Suggesting there is a certain 'taboo' in acknowledging another identity than Palestinian, in fear of 'forgetting' their heritage and their cause.

This taboo was addressed when one of the women from Jerash shared her thoughts on Palestine. Due to her father's Egyptian- Gazan travel documents, she was denied all types of legal status in Jordan. According to the informant, this issue was not something she was facing alone. She argued that the majority of the young generation in the Jerash camp struggled with the same issue and were denied jobs, education and ability to contribute to society due to their parents' Palestinian heritage. However, she made it clear that this is not something you talk about out loud. Only close family would know their personal struggle with identifying as Palestinian. She explained that her family was embarrassed by her personal views and had asked her to lie about her feelings of Palestine if anyone asked her about the subject.

If we look at the informants who did answer Palestinian, they all belong to the 1<sup>st</sup> or 2<sup>nd</sup> generation. This confirms a pattern, where new generations are adapting a more hybrid identity, whereas their grandparents are dearly holding on to their Palestinian identity.

The most popular answer given by representatives for all of the generations seemed to be Jordanian – Palestinian, Jordanian with Palestinian origins is how they explained it. A clear sign that despite being proud Palestinian women, having spent majority of their lives in another country did have an effect on their personal identity.

### 5.1.3 Sense of belonging

Building on the findings from the previous section, it is necessary to explore how the women felt about Jordan and Palestine as separate places. Jordan has physically been the homebase for 2/3rds of the women, for their entire lives. Therefore, it becomes useful and relevant to look at the concept of home, as a psychological concept based on notions that are personal and unique to each individual. The Palestinian women in camps have tried to create a home within architecture that by no means hold the warmth, comfort and familiarity that is associated with notions of home. The physical form of home-making for Palestinian women is a daily struggle based on the structure of the camps alone. The camps are gridded, built as temporary shelters and thus there is a structure and identity of the camps that is not Palestinian.

Data collected from the interviews suggests that the Palestinian women do not feel at home in the refugee camps. There was a sense of hopelessness where they said: “What can we do about it? Nothing” (2<sup>nd</sup> generation, Jabal) and exclaimed that they made the best of their situation. Despite this however, the majority of the informants felt a strong sense of belonging to Jordan and claimed their people were one. In this case it confirmed the idea that the Arab community and culture makes it relatively easy to cross national borders without feeling very estranged to other societies. The feeling of belonging and praise of Jordan were often followed up by gratitude for taking them in and allowing them to stay within their safe borders.

The majority of the informants also reflected over the notion of returning to Palestine. Whilst some, mostly the 1<sup>st</sup> generation were set on returning, the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> generations reflected over what they had to return to. They argued their grandparents’ home were not there anymore and they did not know the land well enough to safely say that they would return given the chance. The 3<sup>rd</sup> generation were mainly concerned with leaving friends, jobs and their social life in Jordan behind, to start fresh in a land they did not physically know.

When questioned about what Palestine meant to them personally, all informants almost exclusively referred to it as the homeland. Despite Jordan providing them with a notion of home, Palestine would always be the home country they belonged to. Their heritage from their grandparents was important and some of the informants claimed their grandparents “would have killed” them, if they heard them speaking of Jordan as ‘home’.

## 5.1.4 Education and work

The Al-Nakba in 1948 forced the Palestinian women to take on a different role in society. In Palestine the women had productive roles such as farmers and bakers, whilst also being housewives. When the conflict broke out their new role became being “the wives and mothers of heroes” (Holt, 2007), in which the women would take great pride in. However, putting such a singular label on a population is side-stepping the women, and neglecting to acknowledge the role they had been given to physically rebuild communities. The Palestinian women that arrived in Jordan were largely from rural settlements and majority of them were illiterate. As a result of having no fields to attend to, and being confined to the walls of their shelters, the women’s sole responsibility was being a housewife (Khatib et al., 2005).

In contrast to the idea that having a housewife is a luxury, for many women of Palestine it seems it is their only option as they struggle to find work. The 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> generation of women living in refugee camps were exclusively housewives (excluding Jerash), and had never held a paid job. Most were poor, some had a working husband and others were dependent on ‘welfare money’ to get by. In contrast, the women of Jerash were all dependent on work, neither had a husband providing for them, nor did they have any right to welfare money. By looking at the pattern of work across generation, there is a clear shift between the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> generations. All women of the 3<sup>rd</sup> generation are either employed or actively seeking work. Although, the fact that they were seeking work did not mean they did not aspire to become housewives one day as well.

Despite not all being employed, all the informants have attended school for a certain time in their lives. Some had been lucky enough attend school in Palestine, before they had to flee, but majority had been educated by UNRWA in the refugee camps. One thing every informant agreed on was the value of education. Some had lost the access to education early and some had gone to university, but they had all enjoyed going to school and wanted access to it. Even the illiterate woman from Baqa’a refugee camp had, as an adult, attended five years of coursework to learn to read and understand the Quran. They all agreed that education and access to information was important to keep a strong Palestinian identity.

In addition to their family, the UNRWA as an organisation had also facilitated learning through school, and taught them about their Palestinian heritage. The restrictions for some refugees to attend school has created a social vulnerability that is often associated with refugee women. If they do not get an education and thus struggle to get work, they automatically lose their options to choose a life.

## 5.1.5 Traditions and rituals

By exploring the ways the Palestinian identity is transferred between generations, traditions, rituals and storytelling are vital. This act of passing down the notion of a Palestinian national pride is integral to the Palestinian refugees.

The informants were questioned on the ways they were taught about their Palestinian heritage, and all informants exclusively answered through storytelling. The stories told by the 1<sup>st</sup> generation of refugees have been vital to the new generations understanding and integrity for the Palestinian cause. The way they spoke about Palestine was so

vivid and beautiful, almost paradise-like: “And they talked about their homeland, until now my mother describes her city of Karatiyya very, very vividly. She would talk about you know how when they were children, they used to play in the vineyards, under the olive trees and how they would pick fruit and eat. How they would see the water when it was running through the fields and watering everything and she would describe their houses even” (1<sup>st</sup> generation, non-camp).

In addition to the art of storytelling, they mentioned cooking, clothing, with emphasis on the Palestinian dress, sewing and embroidery as part of their heritage. All these traditions might seem small but all provide threads to the past (Unrwa.org, 2014). As the camps became more permanent and grew in size, the women’s ability to materialize their memories of Palestinian traditions became a constant representation of their struggle. Motifs, depictions and stories of Palestine can be seen in the art and architecture of the camps, reinforcing their sense of collective identity.

The traditional ways of cooking Palestinian cuisine was also an important way of keeping their heritage alive. The women living outside the camps explained they did not cook the traditional cuisines as often anymore, because it was hard work. Whilst the women living in camps, where majority were housewives gave the art of cooking greater importance. However, informants from all generations and locations admitted to becoming more ‘lazy’ in relation to cooking. The traditional Palestinian bread their grandmothers used to bake, could now be bought in the store, and thus they would rather buy it, than bake it.

In the case of the Palestinian dress, majority of the women all had one they used to wear, and claimed their grandmothers ‘never took it off’ until the day they passed away. The thobe, which it is called, has very specially embroidery. The embroidery has different cross-stitch patterns, which all represent the different villages of Palestine. By wearing the dresses, the women become “directly” tied to the village and land they belong to. The endurance of making and inheriting these dresses, display a great determination by the Palestinian women to ensure that the Palestinian identity and its land, is never lost (Holt, 2015).

## 5.2. Analysis

*Has it changed?*

By posing the question of: “Has it changed?”, this section seeks to compare the findings of the primary research with the theories of the secondary research to explore;

- *How has the Palestinian identity changed across generations in Jordan?*
- *What role do the women of Palestine have in securing a Palestinian identity in the diasporas?*
- *What does the future look like for the Palestinian identity in the diasporas?*

These questions will be explored by looking at the notion of national identity, gender, intersectionality and hybridity as discussed in Chapter 3.

## 5.2.1 National identity

- *How has the Palestinian identity changed across generations in Jordan?*

“The old will die, and the young will forget” (Suleiman, 2016: 202) words claimed to be spoken by David Ben-Gurion, the first prime minister of Israel, in reference to the Palestinians. The first part of that statement is true, the second however, is not. Three generations later and the young have proven Ben-Gurion wrong, they have not forgotten.

For the Palestinians living in Palestine, their national identity is all around them in their daily life. It is in the olive trees, in the fields, in the land they walk on, it gives them strength and motivates them in their daily struggles against the opposition. The Palestinian national identity can also be felt and seen in places far from Palestine. The diaspora extended around the world, exudes the Palestinian identity, despite not having been or seen their homeland.

Like always, the Palestinian collective identity is still strong, but the notion of what it means to be a Palestinian however, has changed. Majority of the narrators of Palestinian history and identity now live outside of Palestine, in the diasporas. The first generation of Palestinian refugees, those who lived and breath for the land of Palestine, are slowly dying. Their notion of Palestinian identity is connected to their memories. Their memories of physically living in Palestine before the conflicts broke out, the beauty of the land they were forced to leave behind. These memories have been the foundation for which the next generations of Palestinians in the diaspora, will identify and feel about their homeland. Their notion of a Palestinian identity is something they would never set aside or feel distant from. The younger generations of Palestinians are born into other communities and societies. They have been given “new” nationalities that does not have any connection to their grandparents’ heritage, and so their Palestinian identity is different. The Palestinian identity in the diaspora are no longer specific memories, but a feeling of belonging to something they do not know, due to the injustice experienced by their grandparents.

The young generations in Jordan expressed themselves in a way of insecurity. It seems their Palestinian identity could feel diluted, because they were born in a diaspora. This feeling of dilution is not experienced only by the younger generations of Jordan, but also in other parts of the world (Suleiman, 2016). This feeling of a torn personal identity is not irrational, but actually quite sensible. Holding a citizenship and legal status in another nation has great meaning. By having equal rights and opportunities in accordance with the law is something many Palestinian have been denied in the past, and thus holding on to those ‘perks’ can be very meaningful and important to the new generations of Palestinians. When considering what a legal status can mean for a person’s nationality and sense of belonging we can look to the women of Jerash as examples. One of the women who currently have no legal status, felt lost in the middle. She did not have any strong feelings of belonging to the Jordanian identity nor the Palestinian identity. As far as she was concerned without any legal status, she had no national identity.

The women in Jordan were certainly torn in explaining their complex relationship with Jordan as a ‘home’ but not their home country. Through their grandparents they had felt a deep and meaningful connectedness to Palestine, but they did not necessarily feel a need to move their lives in Jordan - to Palestine if given the chance. It seems what has connected the Palestinian identity to younger generations in the diasporas have been the fight for justice and awareness, and the fight for their Right of Return.

Their Right of Return has become such an important topic, that it has almost become a contemporary part of the Palestinian Identity. It has been decades since the catastrophe hit Palestinians, and yet they are still being treated with injustice and as exceptions to international law by being denied their rights. In addition to this, the Jordanian government have since the mid-2000s been revoking Palestinians' citizenship based on their strong connection to Palestine. The informants from the research claimed the government were arguing that their still strong Palestinian identity was proof that they were not Jordanians, and thus should not have the rights of being one. The previous Jordanian Minister Nayif al-Qadi defended the revocations by claiming the government was doing it to help consolidate them with their right to Palestine (Arab Renaissance for Democracy & Development, 2015). The Jordanian government is in this case confirming the power legal status can have on the notion of national identity and belonging. Despite that some of the younger generations are hesitant to move to Palestine permanently, they would be allowed to travel and visit the land that they belong to, which is why the Right of Return is so close to their hearts.

## 5.2.2 Gender

- *What role do the women of Palestine have in securing a Palestinian identity in the diasporas?*

The vulnerability often connected to refugee women is bound to restrictions society lay upon them. Often the women are referred to as almost second class citizens, in comparison to the men. In the Palestinian struggle for nationality, the male narrative has almost exclusively been told as the main story. The men are the ones out in the street fighting the opposition, sacrificing their lives to the cause. Make no mistake, the men of Palestine are heroes and fighters, however neglecting the female narrative in this cause is belittling the women of Palestine to be perceived as bystanders in their own fight (Holt, 2007).

One of the discoveries during my primary research is how misplaced the word 'vulnerability' can be in relation to the Palestinian women. When assessing the way and the strength of the women and the way they picked themselves up, their kids, and their community, and moved across borders to secure a future for themselves, the word vulnerable does not come to mind.

For refugees the physical opposition and visual heroism of the Palestinian resistance have disappeared, and the roles of the Palestinian men have been reduced to idleness within the refugee camps. Generations of Palestinian refugees have been born into exile with no direct reference or memory of such resistance (Holt, 2007). Palestinian men in the diasporas have become citizens of a new society, going to work to provide for their families, much like before they had to flee. Whilst the remaining men are out working, the women have been responsible for keeping the Palestinian communities and camps going.

When the women in Jordan were asked about their role in the camp, they all laughingly replied with: "I am the boss. Everything. I am the father and the mother all at once. [...] I handle all responsibilities. I manage everything. And they are very dependent on me" (2<sup>nd</sup> generation, Jabal el Hussein). Every informant was from a culture and tradition with a female headed household, which seemed to be the norm. Some argue that the role of the Palestinian women in society has become limited and more confined by living in refugee camps. This argument is presented by academics like (Khatib et al., 2005), but also by the older generation of Palestinian women living in the camps. Had these

generations of women been allowed to grow up in Palestine, it might have been a different story, we will never know. However, all the women from the primary research was eager to go to school, they wanted an education, and took every chance they got to expand their horizon. Nonetheless, the lack of opportunities and restriction from living in a refugee camp led to them getting married and becoming housewives.

Even so, the possibility to choose for Palestinian women might have become more limited, yet their responsibilities have only gotten bigger. Being referred to as 'only housewives' is quite demeaning to the job the women do every day. The first 'wave' of housewives physically created new Palestinian communities despite the fact that the camps had limited or no potential of becoming anything resembling a home. The proof of home-making is visible when walking through the refugee camps. Understanding that each plant or pot in windows and along houses have been put there under the heavy burden of nurturing and protecting a Palestinian identity within the camp (Johnson, 1980). Following the first 'wave' of housewives, the generations after have to the best of their ability kept this work up. Through traditional cooking, storytelling and sewing, the Palestinian women have become the guardians of the Palestinian memory and communal identity (Johnson, 2009).

As previously stated the women are proud to be referred to as the wives and mothers of heroes, but the physical resistance is not relevant to the Palestinians in the diaspora anymore. The mothers have become the Palestinian heroes in the diaspora. The women who raise the children and transfers their knowledge of Palestine to the next generation. The job of instilling the right attitudes and ensuring the new generations know their heritage and history has been the key to keeping a strong Palestinian identity. By looking at the 3<sup>rd</sup> generation of women, it is made evident that in contrast to the claims of Chapter 3, where young women are predestined to 'only' become housewives, they are encouraged to go to school and get a job.

The way of transferring knowledge and identity have changed from the 1<sup>st</sup> generation to the 3<sup>rd</sup>, yet the power of storytelling and traditional symbols like the thobe, are still as significant today as it were when they first arrived in Jordan. Through their work in the camps, the women of Palestine have been able to take the very ordinary and transform it into something extraordinary (Holt, 2007).

### 5.2.3 Intersectionality and Hybridity

- *What does the future look like for the Palestinian identity in the diasporas?*

#### Hybridity

Questions of identity emerge in every community that is separated from its origins however it is made worse when the community have been forcibly expatriated (Suleiman, 2016). The Palestinian identity has undoubtedly withstood its biggest challenge and threat so far; that the majority of its population have been evicted and dispersed all around the world.

As seen in section 5.2.1 the Palestinian identity in the diaspora have changed from a proud nationalistic feeling of good memories, to a sense of belonging to the homeland that had unjustly been taken from them. It has become more of a statement among the young generations to fight for the rights of the Palestinians still left. This passion for

the Palestinian cause, has to a large degree become defining for their identity in Jordan. It has created a hybrid identity for the Palestinians in Jordan, who are drawn to other new identities whilst holding on to the stories of their grandparents. This balance between 'new' and 'old' is what is going to define the future of their identity.

Supporting Palestine outside the diaspora and Palestine have become 'fashionable' according to Suha Shakkour (Suleiman, 2016). Some of the women from Jordan were hopeful when questioned about the future. Several made the point of the growing awareness for their cause and the many foreign activist now working with them, "just look at yourself" (1<sup>st</sup> generation, Jabal el Hussein). This in itself is ensuring good prospects for the Palestinians future. "I think this it built within us, we will never forget and we will never let go. Never ever. The Israelis said something, one of their leaders said that: The grandfathers will go out, their children maybe they will remember, but their grandchildren will forget. Never, this will never happen" (2<sup>nd</sup> generation, non-camp) These are the words from a young woman, of the new generation. Despite finding it easy to become absorbed into other identities, the history and identity of Palestine will not be forgotten if it is up to them, as they feel it stronger every day.

The intersection of being a woman and a Palestinian carries great responsibility. According to the informants, it is solely up to the women and mothers of the future to keep transferring the Palestinian identity from generation to generation. Even, in spite of her resentment towards her Palestinian heritage for the limitations it has put on her life, the woman of the 2<sup>nd</sup> generation from Jerash were going to teach her kids about Palestine. The hope is that they would have a better life than her, and experience the positive sides of being Palestinian. It is not just the hybridity of "old" and "new" identities, that will define the future of Palestine, but also the change in storytellers. The women; the storytellers in the diaspora are identifying differently, and facing new challenges. Thus, the future of the Palestinian identity is dependent on their personal struggle and connection to the home country.

### Intersectionality

The theory of intersectionality, which can be found in chapter 2, suggests that Palestinian women living in refugee camps outside their own country will be at a high risk of being marginalised. The risk is based on the idea that women are more marginalised than men, thus the weaker sex, combined with being a refugee in another country. However, this is based upon the 'western' way of assessing intersectionality, whilst the situation for the women of Palestine might be different. By recognising different cultural traditions, and how naturalized narratives can be different from each other, we can better understand the context for Palestinian refugees in Jordan. Theories inspired by 'Western societies', for example feminism, often neglects to understand the different aspects of gender roles in different cultures (Okin, 1998). According to the information the women in Jordan provided there is little or nothing suggesting that they feel marginalised due to their gender, despite the 'common belief' that they are. The women claimed to be the boss of everything, and given more respect due to their gender, opposed to what the intersectionality theory suggests. Many said that their gender had empowered them, rather than restrained them in any way, suggesting that within the walls of Palestinian camps, maybe the woman really is the stronger sex (Yuval-Davis, 2006).

Despite their personal belief, they are at risk of being marginalised based on their gender by different structures in society. An example of this is the way citizenship in Jordan follows the father. By not allowing mothers to transfer their citizenship to their children, they are effectively marginalising women and their status in society. As a consequence of this, many children and women are further marginalised from participating in society, solely based on their fathers legal status.

In the areas the women did feel marginalised or treated differently, they claimed it was due to their Palestinian origin. Majority of the informants all agreed that the Palestinians and Jordanians had morphed into one people. They felt accepted and as full members of society around them, because they were all Arabs. Separating the people into different categories did not benefit anyone. In addition, the camps are so well integrated into the surrounding communities; it can be hard to know when you cross 'the line' into a camp. However, in contrast to themselves, they also admitted to being treated differently on the basis of their names, which gave away that they were Palestinian. In two instances, this happened, and it was in the public sector, and the example several of them used; if they were stopped by the police while driving. Providing clear examples of how they were being marginalised because of their origins, but seemingly unfazed by the realization of it.

Like the rest of the world, the community in Jordan is becoming more open minded and modern. Consequently, the women are given more opportunities, thus reducing the experience of marginalisation. Several of the Palestinian women, both from refugee camps and non-camps had acquired a university degree regardless of their fathers disapproval. One of the women had commuted to another city every day, whilst a second had gotten a scholarship to go abroad. It seems the informants were trying to break the barriers that follows their intersectionality, and thus allowing them to better integrate and contribute to their society. Compared to the 1<sup>st</sup> generation of women, who seemed unaffected by these marginalisation's, the younger generations were more aware of the marginalisation they were experiencing and effectively trying to break out of them. As a result, the younger generations do not feel restrained to the walls of the camp, destined to be a housewife. Several of the informants were excited and hoping to be a working mother and a housewife. Thus, both of the women mentioned above went on to work for the Jordanian public sector, contributing to the future of Jordan by breaking barriers of their personal intersectionality.

"I can see the women everywhere in Palestinian life, and I see how they exist between the syrupy sentimentalism of roles we ascribe to them (mothers, virgins, martyrs) and the annoyance, even dislike, that their unassimilated strength provokes in our warily politicised automatic manhood" (Said, 1986: 77).

## 6.0 Conclusion

The aims of this dissertation set out to understand the changes the Palestinian identity has gone through in the diaspora. Through the literature review, and doing secondary research it was discovered a gap in representation of female narratives. As a result of that void, the research questions were formulated to conduct a generational study of women in the diaspora, with focus on their developing identities. The dissertation set out to answer the following questions:

- *How has the Palestinian identity changed across generations in Jordan?*
- *What role do the women of Palestine have in securing a Palestinian identity in the diaspora?*
- *What does the future look like for the Palestinian identity in the diaspora?*

Through qualitative interviews with the women, it was revealed that there has been a clear change in the notion of a Palestinian identity from the 1<sup>st</sup> generation to the 3<sup>rd</sup>. Acknowledging that majority of the informants and the Palestinian people have never been to the physical land of Palestine, made the basis for the primary research more interesting. By exploring the effects their legal status, their sense of belonging and their role in a host society, had on their Palestinian identity it was made clear that it is still deeply rooted within them.

By comparing the answers provided by the informants, it is evident that the 1<sup>st</sup> generation of refugees hold an identity based on collective memories of the beautiful land they used to live in. Their memories and longing for their home country, where they were raised before the conflict is what has shaped the identity of the generations coming after. After 70 years of exile, the identity in the diaspora has become a constructed feeling of belonging, rather than a natural feeling of missing home, as it was for the first generation of refugees.

For the younger generations the Palestinian identity has taken the form of belonging to a land that is rightfully theirs, and a fight for the rights that were taken from their ancestors. Mahmoud Darwish describes the change by stating that, "The metaphor for Palestine is stronger than the Palestine of "reality" (Darwish, 1995).

In the aftermath of violent conflicts, imprisonment and occupation, the refugee women were given new responsibilities. By rebuilding communities, and creating new homes for their families, the women tried to create a little piece of Palestine within the camps they were given refuge. Through storytelling, wearing of the thobe and cooking traditional Palestinian food, the women have successfully implemented a collective hybrid Palestinian identity in the new generations. In a subtle act of resistance the narrative of women have formed the future of Palestinian resistance and identity within Jordan.

It is safe to say that the Palestinian refugees have managed to hold on to a collective identity, despite being dispersed around the world. The future for the diaspora are difficult to predict. By increasing Palestinians access to education and work, thus breaking their intersectionality and providing them with information is ensuring a promising future for their collective identity. In addition to this, international recognition for a Palestinian state seem to be going up, and not the opposite direction, proving a growing awareness for the Palestinian cause. A factor that makes the identity in the diaspora uncertain is the risk they have of being absorbed into other identities. Considering a need

for acceptance and belonging, which Palestinians might be more vulnerable to it seems that can be a threat towards their notion of a future national identity.

This dissertation has tried to emphasize the different struggles refugees might face during long time stays in host communities. The stories and experience of women who had to flee and how their descendants have experienced being born as refugees, have provided an insight into how identities can change over time. It is also evident that identities and a sense of belonging can be hybrid, and does not necessarily have to be either or. This dissertation has shown that the Palestinian people, in particular the women in the diaspora in Jordan are strongminded and staunchly to their heritage and home country, despite being well integrated into other societies.

# Bibliography

- Abed, O. (2004). *FMO Research guide: Palestinian refugees in Jordan*. Repository.forcedmigration.org. Available at: [http://repository.forcedmigration.org/show\\_metadata.jsp?pid=fmo:5138](http://repository.forcedmigration.org/show_metadata.jsp?pid=fmo:5138) [Accessed 17 Sep. 2018].
- Abu-Odeh, A. (1999). *Jordanians, Palestinians & Hashemite Kingdom in the Middle East Peace Process*. Washington: United States Institute of Peace Press.
- Anderson, B. (1983). *Imagined communities*. 1st ed. London: Verso.
- Anthias, F. (2001). New hybridities, old concepts: the limits of 'culture'. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 24(4), pp.619-641.
- Arab Renaissance for Democracy & Development (2015). *Mapping the Legal Obstacles Palestinians Face in Jordan*. Jordan: ARDD - Legal Aid. Available at: [https://ardd-jo.org/sites/default/files/resource-files/mapping\\_the\\_legal\\_obstacles\\_palestinians\\_face\\_in\\_jordan\\_en.pdf](https://ardd-jo.org/sites/default/files/resource-files/mapping_the_legal_obstacles_palestinians_face_in_jordan_en.pdf) [Accessed 18 Aug. 2018].
- Ashmore, R., Deaux, K. and McLaughlin-Volpe, T. (2004). An Organizing Framework for Collective Identity: Articulation and Significance of Multidimensionality. *Psychological Bulletin*, 130(1), pp.80-114.
- BBC News. (2018). *Gaza begins to bury its dead*. Available at: <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-44116340> [Accessed 15 May 2018].
- Ben-Ze'ev, E. (2011). *Remembering Palestine in 1948*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Billig, M. (1995). *Banal nationalism*. SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Brun, C. (2001). Reterritorializing the Relationship between People and Place in Refugee Studies. *Geografiska Annaler, Series B: Human Geography*, 83B(1), pp.15-25.
- Cohen, P. (1988). The Perversions of Inheritance. In: P. Cohen and H. Bains, ed., *Multi-Racist Britain*. London: Macmillan.
- Crenshaw, Kimberlé (1989) 'Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics', *University of Chicago Legal Forum* 138-67
- Darwish, M. and Muhawi, I. (1995). *Memory for forgetfulness*. 1<sup>st</sup> ed. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press
- Esses, V., Veenvliet, S., Hodson, G. and Mihic, L. (2008). Justice, Morality, and the Dehumanization of Refugees. *Social Justice Research*, 21(1), pp.4-25.
- Gabbay, S. (2014). The Status of Palestinians in Jordan and the Anomaly of Holding a Jordanian Passport. *Journal of Political Sciences & Public Affairs*, 02(01).
- Gellner, E. (2006). *Nations and nationalism*. Blackwell Publishing.
- Genet, J. (1983). Four Hours in Shatila. *Journal of Palestine Studies*, 12(3), pp.3-22.

General Assembly resolution 194 (III), *Palestine – Progress Report of the United Nations Mediator*, A/RES/195 (11 December 1948).

General Assembly resolution 2254 (ES-V), *Humanitarian assistance*, A/RES/ 2252 (11 December 1948).

Greenfeld, L. and Chirot, D. (1994). Nationalism and aggression. *Theory and Society*, 23(1), pp.79-130.

Holmes, M. (2007). *What is Gender? Sociological Approaches*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Holt, M. (2007). The wives and mothers of heroes: Evolving identities of Palestinian refugee women in Lebanon. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 43(2), pp.245-264.

Holt, M. (2015) ‘An Invented People’: Palestinian Refugee Women and Meanings of Home’, *ACME: An International E-Journal for Critical Geographies*, 14(2), pp.98-106

Hu, X., Bergström, Z., Gagnepain, P. and Anderson, M. (2017). Suppressing Unwanted Memories Reduces Their Unintended Influences. *Current Directions in Psychological Science*, 26(2), pp.197-206.

Human Rights Watch (2010). *Stateless Again, Palestinian-Origin Jordanians Deprived of their Nationality*. HRW. Available at: <https://www.hrw.org/report/2010/02/01/stateless-again/palestinian-origin-jordanians-deprived-their-nationality> [Accessed 16 Aug. 2018].

#### *Interview Transcripts 1- 12*

Jenkins, R. (2008). *Social identity*. 3rd ed. London: Routledge.

Johnson, P. (1980) ‘Voices from the camps Palestinians: From peasants to revolutionaries. Rosemary Sayigh’, *Journal of Palestine Studies*, 9(2), pp. 122-126.

Johnson, P. (2009). ‘What Rosemary saw: Reflections on the Palestinian Women as tellers of the Palestinian present’, *Journal of Palestine Studies*, 38(4), pp.29-46.

Justice.gov. (2009). *RRT Research Response*. Available at: <https://www.justice.gov/sites/default/files/eoir/legacy/2013/12/04/JOR35401-Palestinians-West%20Bank.pdf> [Accessed 9 Jul. 2018].

Khalidi, R. (2010). *Palestinian identity*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Khatib, A., Musmar, M. and Arafat, R. (2005). Housing environment and women’s health in a Palestinian refugee camp. *International Journal of Environmental Health Research*, 15(3), pp.181-191.

King-Irani, L. (2007). Exiled to a liminal legal zone: are we all Palestinians now?. *Third World Quarterly*, 27(5), pp.923-936.

Massey, D. (1994). *Space, Place and Gender*. Polity Press: Cambridge.

Obeidat, B., Shannak, R., Masa’deh, R. and Al-Jarrah, I. (2012). Toward Better Understanding for Arabian Culture: Implications Based on Hofstede’s Cultural Model. *European Journal of Social Science*, 28(4), pp.512-522.

Obeidat, B., Shannak, R., Masa’deh, R. and Al-Jarrah, I. (2012). Toward Better Understanding for Arabian Culture: Implications Based on Hofstede’s Cultural Model. *European Journal of Social Science*, 28(4), pp.512-522.

- Okin, S. (1998). Feminism and Multiculturalism: Some Tensions. *Ethics*, 108(4), pp.661-684.
- Orgad, L. (2015). The Cultural Defense of Nations: A Liberal Theory of Majority Rights. *Human Rights Law Review*, 16(4), pp.802-805.
- Parsons, T. and Bales, R. (1956). *Family, socialization and interaction process*. London: Routledge.
- Passport Index - All the world's passports in one place. (2018). *Global Passport Power Rank*. Available at: <https://www.passportindex.org/byRank.php> [Accessed 21 Sep. 2018].
- Preece, S. (2016). *The Routledge handbook of language and identity*. Basingstoke: Taylor & Francis Ltd.
- Rabinowitz, D. (1994). The Common Memory of Loss: Political Mobilization among
- Raissiguier, C. (1999) The construction of marginal identities: working-class girls of Algerian descent in a French school, in S. Hesse-Biber, C. Gilmartin and R. Lydenberg (eds.) *Feminist Approaches to Theory and Methodology: An Interdisciplinary Reader* (Oxford: Oxford University Press)
- Sa'di, A. (2002). Catastrophe, Memory and Identity: Al-Nakbah as a component of Palestinian identity. *Israel Studies*, 7(2), pp.175-198.
- Said, E. (1986). *After the Last Sky: Palestinian Lives*. London: Farber and Farber.
- Said, E. (1992). *The Question of Palestine*. Random House.
- Sanbar, E. (2001). Out of Place, Out of Time. *Mediterranean Historical Review*, 16(1), pp.87-94
- Sayej, L. (2018). *Palestinian Refugees and the Right of Return in International Law*. OHRH. Available at: <http://ohrh.law.ox.ac.uk/palestinian-refugees-and-the-right-of-return-in-international-law/> [Accessed 10 Sep. 2018].
- Sharpe, S. (1976). *Just Like a Girl: How Girls Learn to be Women*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.
- Strawson, J. (2010). *Partitioning Palestine*. London: Pluto Press.
- Suleiman, Y. (2016). *Being Palestinian: Personal Reflections on Palestinian Identity in the Diaspora*. Edinburgh University Press.
- Sydie, R. (1987). *Natural Women/ Cultured Men: A Feminist Perspective on Sociological Theory*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.
- Tuan, Y.F. (1980): 'Rootedness versus sense of place', *Landscape*, 25: 3-8.
- Unicef.org. (2010). *The Situation of Palestinian Children in The Occupied Palestinian Territory, Jordan, Syria and Lebanon*. Available at: [https://www.unicef.org/oPt/PALESTINIAN\\_SITAN-final.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/oPt/PALESTINIAN_SITAN-final.pdf) [Accessed 2 Aug. 2018].
- United Nations (2012). *General Assembly Votes Overwhelmingly to Accord Palestine 'Non-Member Observer State' Status in United Nations*. Available at: <https://www.un.org/press/en/2012/ga11317.doc.htm> [Accessed 9 Aug. 2018].

- Unrwa.org. (2014). *The Long Journey of Palestine Refugee Women*. Available at: [https://www.unrwa.org/sites/default/files/unrwa\\_album\\_-\\_low.pdf](https://www.unrwa.org/sites/default/files/unrwa_album_-_low.pdf) [Accessed 27 Sep. 2018].
- UNRWA.org. (n.d.). *Who We Are*. Available at: <https://www.unrwa.org/who-we-are>
- Walliman, N. (2011). *Research Methods: the basics*. Routledge.
- Yuval-Davis, N. (2006). Intersectionality and Feminist Politics. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 13(3), pp.193-209.

# Appendix 1 - Interview Guide

How has the female narrative of the Palestinian identity developed over three generations in Jordan?

This is not the final question; just a formulation to remind myself of what I am 'looking' for in the answers to the questions.

1. How old are you?
  2. Where do you live?
  3. How long have you lived there?
    - Where did you live before that?
  4. Who do you live with?
    - Daughter?
    - Mother?
    - Grandmother?
  5. How do you feel about living here/there?
    - Do they like it? If no, then why not?
  6. Where does your family come from?
  7. What do you consider to be your role in the home?
  8. Do you have a job/ go to school?
  9. How much education do you have? How long have you gone to school?
  10. How do you feel about your job/ studies? (Do you like it? Are you happy?)
  11. Do you work or go to school with Palestinians and Jordanians?
  12. What type of legal status do you have?
    - 5 year passport?
    - 2 year passport?
    - ID?
    - None?
  13. Is your legal status different from the other people you live with?
    - Why?
  14. If you were to define yourself, would you identify as a Palestinian or Jordanian?
    - Trans Jordanian?
    - Palestinian-Jordanians?
  15. Can you explain why you would identify yourself as \*answer\*?
    - Does it have anything to do with their legal status?
    - Does your legal status effect how you consider yourself?
  16. Do you think the people you live with would identify in the same way?
  17. Do you think the Jordanian community agrees with your identification of yourself?
    - Do you feel accepted as a part of the Jordanian community? Or an outsider?
  18. What type of legal status would you wish to have?
    - If they have citizenship: Do you feel like you are a full member of the society?
    - Or if they want it: Do they believe that will make them a full member of the society?
- (This may be answered in Q.17.)

19. Have you ever been in Palestine (after 1948)? When, Where?
20. Can you describe what your Palestinian background/identity means to you?
21. How does your identity as a Palestinian affect you in your everyday life?
22. Has it changed in any way over the years? (Gotten stronger or weaker in any way?)
23. Are there any other parts of your identity that you consider to be defining?
  - Woman
  - Daughter
  - Mother
  - Refugee?
  - Education?
24. In what way do they affect you? Do they empower or restrain?
25. Do you think your identity plays a big role in your life?
  - Why/ why not?
26. Has your mother/ grandmother played a part in forming your understanding of your Palestinian identity? If so, how?
27. Are there any other organizations or people in your life that have been significant in shaping your understanding of your Palestinian identity?
28. Are there any special traditions or rituals your mother/ grandmother do/ have done to teach you about your Palestinian heritage?
  - Are there any traditions and or rituals you will be transferring/ teaching your future kids? (If they have any, or are going to)
29. If I say "home", what does that word mean to you?
  - Is home for you a specific place? Or is it where your family is?
  - Do you consider Jordan to be home?
  - Do you find a feeling of "home" in communities, rather than places?
30. Has your idea and definition of home changed over time? How?
31. Do you feel like your home has a connection to your identity? In what way?
  - Has this connection changed over time?
32. Do you think your daughter/ mother/ grandmother would agree with your understanding of "home"?
33. Do you ever argue or have discussions with your daughter/ mother/ grandmother?
34. What do you disagree on?
  - Is it housework?
  - Clothing?
  - Work/ education?
35. Why do you think you disagree on these subjects?
  - Is it related to:
  - Moving around?
  - Traditions connected to Palestine?
  - Different generations?
36. Do you think a Palestinian woman's role in society has changed from your grandmothers/mothers generation to your/ your daughter's generation?
  - If so, how and why?
37. In 20 years from now, what do you think the Palestinian identity will look like here in Jordan? Weaker? Stronger?

## **Research Project on Palestinian women**

### **Invitation paragraph**

You are being invited to take part in a research study. Before you make a decision whether or not to take part, it is important for you to understand why the research is being done and what it will involve. Please take time to read the following information carefully.

### **What is the purpose of the study?**

As a part of my Masters degree in Development and Emergency Practice, I am writing a dissertation on the identity and role of Palestinian women in Jordan. The reason for this is that, I would like to give the women of Palestine a platform to tell their story, as most of the research in the field is focused on the narratives of men. In addition to this the study will provide a deeper understanding of the life of the Palestinian people living in diasporas. Therefore I would like to interview Palestinian women about their experience living outside of Palestine for generations, and how that has affected their role in society and their way of identifying.

### **Why have I been invited to participate?**

I am asking you to participate as you are a woman of the generations of Palestinians that came to or were born in Jordan as a result of the Al-Nakba, in 1948. In total the study will consist of about 12 interviews with Palestinian women, in different ages, from three different generations.

### **Do I have to take part?**

Participating in this research is completely voluntarily. It is up to you to decide whether or not to take part. If you do decide to take part you will be given this information sheet to keep and be asked to sign a consent form. If you decide to take part you are still free to withdraw at any time and without giving a reason.

### **What will happen to me if I take part?**

The interview will last for about an hour, where I will be asking questions about heritage, history and your current situation, allowing you to tell me how you see yourself and your everyday life, and what role Palestine plays into that.

The results I get from the interviews will be used to analyse if the role of the Palestinian women who have been living outside of Palestine since 1948 have changed over three generations, and if so how.

### **What are the possible benefits of taking part?**

By participating in this study, you will be contributing to a richer understanding of the life of the Palestinian people who had to flee their homeland. To participate will also support the empowerment of women such as yourself, and highlight the important roles they have in communities and families.

### **Will what I say in this study be kept confidential?**

All information collected in the study will be kept strictly confidential and anonymous, thus names or important details about your life will never be used or shared with anyone outside the interviewer, the participant and the translator, who are present during the interview.

All data will be kept secured and collected in a Google drive account, in which the University has a security agreement. This will be done at all times in accordance with the Universities legal requirements. Data generated by the study must also be retained in accordance with the University's policy on Academic Integrity and will be kept securely in paper or electronic form for a period of ten years after the completion of a research project.

**What should I do if I want to take part?**

If you wish to take part, you let me (Marita) or the translator (Lina) know, and we will facilitate a safe and private place for the interview to take place, after the consent form is signed.

If you have any questions before taking part, contact either Marita or Lina and we will be happy to answer any question that may arise.

**What will happen to the results of the research study?**

All the data collected will be used and analysed in a Masters dissertation for Oxford Brookes University. The dissertation will be finished and available after 28<sup>th</sup> of September.

If you wish to access or get a copy of the dissertation once finished, you can contact Marita Akersveen through the details at the bottom of the page, or send a request through Oxford Brookes University who will be happy to help.

**Who is organising and funding the research?**

The research is organised and funded by Marita Akersveen, a student in Development and Emergency Practice at Oxford Brookes University.

Participating in the study is pro-bono, meaning without any form of payment to the participants.

**Who has reviewed the study?**

The research has been approved by the University Research Ethics Committee, at Oxford Brookes University.

**Contact for Further Information**

If you have any questions or need further information, you can contact me at:

Email: [17039621@brookes.ac.uk](mailto:17039621@brookes.ac.uk)

Phone: +4798863399

If you have any concerns about the way in which the study has been conducted, you can contact the Chair of the University Research Ethics Committee on [ethics@brookes.ac.uk](mailto:ethics@brookes.ac.uk).

**Thank you for taking your time to read this information sheet.**

# Appendix 3- Ethics Form

TDE Form E1



## Faculty of Technology, Design and Environment - Ethics Review Form E1

- This form should be completed jointly by the **Supervisor and Student** who is undertaking a research/major project which involves human participants.
- It is the **Supervisor** who is responsible for exercising appropriate professional judgement in this review.
- Before completing this form, please refer to the University **Code of Practice for the Ethical Standards for Research involving Human Participants**, available at <http://www.brookes.ac.uk/Research/Research-ethics/> and to any guidelines provided by relevant academic or professional associations.
- Note that the ethics review process needs to fully completed and signed **before fieldwork commences**.

(i) **Project Title:** A female narrative of Palestinian identity in Jordan

(ii) **Name of Supervisor and School in which located:** Cathrine Brun, DEP

(iii) **Name of Student and Student Number:** Marita Martinsen Akersveen, 17039621

(iv) **Brief description of project outlining where human participants will be involved (30-50 words):**

I will be conducting interviews in a Palestinian refugee camp in Jordan with focus on identity. I wish to look at the development of the Palestinian identity through the female lens across three generations outside of Palestine. I am therefore looking to interview 10-15 participants, preferably older than 18, and hopefully in families with three generations of women.

		Yes	No
1.	Does the study involve participants who are unable to give informed consent (e.g. children, people with learning disabilities)?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
2.	If the study will involve participants who are unable to give informed consent (e.g. children under the age of 18, people with learning disabilities), will you be unable to obtain permission from their parents or guardians (as appropriate)?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
3.	Will the study require the cooperation of a gatekeeper for initial access to groups or individuals to be recruited (e.g. students, members of a self-help group, employees of a company)?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
4.	Are there any problems with the participants' right to remain anonymous, or to have the information they give not identifiable as theirs?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

5.	Will it be necessary for the participants to take part in the study without their knowledge/consent at the time? (e.g. covert observation of people in non-public places?)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
6.	Will the study involve discussion of or responses to questions the participants might find sensitive? (e.g. own traumatic experiences)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
7.	Are drugs, placebos or other substances (e.g. food substances, vitamins) to be administered to the study participants?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
8.	Will blood or tissue samples be obtained from participants?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
9.	Is pain or more than mild discomfort likely to result from the study?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
10.	Could the study induce psychological stress or anxiety?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
11.	Will the study involve prolonged or repetitive testing of participants?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
12.	Will financial inducements (other than reasonable expenses and compensation for time) be offered to participants?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
13.	Will deception of participants be necessary during the study?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
14.	Will the study involve NHS patients, staff, carers or premises?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

<b>Signed:</b>		<b>Supervisor</b>
<b>Signed:</b>	M.M.A.	<b>Student</b>
<b>Date:</b>	29/06 - 2018	

### What to do now:

1. If you have answered 'no' to all the above questions:
  - (a) The student must **send** the completed and fully signed E1 form to their **Dissertation Module Leader**.
  - (b) The student must keep a copy of the E1 form which must be bound into their dissertation as an appendix.
  - (c) The supervisor must keep a copy of the E1 form as they are responsible for monitoring compliance during the fieldwork.
  
2. If you have answered 'yes' to **any** of the above questions:
  - (a) The supervisor and student must complete the TDE E2 form available at <http://www.brookes.ac.uk/Research/Research-ethics/Ethics-review-forms/>
  - (b) Note that the information in the E2 must be in **sufficient detail** for the ethical implications to be clearly identified.
  - (c) The signed E2 and signed E1 Form must be emailed to Bridget Durning (bdurning@brookes.ac.uk) who is the Faculty Research Ethics Officer (FREO) for review. Please allow **at least two weeks** for this review process.
  - (d) If/when approved the FREO will issue an E3 Ethics Approval Notice.
  - (e) The student must send the E1, E2 and E3 Notice **to the Dissertation Module Leader**.
  - (f) The student must also keep copies which must be bound into their dissertation as an appendix.
  - (g) The supervisor must keep a copy of documentation to monitor compliance during field work.